## Exhibit 8

```
1
            IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
         FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA
 2
 3
     ELIZABETH PANZARELLA :
 4
 5
     & JOSHUA PANZARELLA, :
     INDIVIDUALLY & ON BEHALF
 6
     OF ALL OTHERS SIMILARLY:
     SITUATED
8
           Plaintiffs :
9
10
             VS.
11
     NAVIENT SOLUTIONS, LLC: CASE NO.
12
            Defendant : 2:18-CV-03735-PBT
13
14
15
          Oral testimony of ELIZABETH
16
17
     PANZARELLA, taken at Greenberg Traurig, LLP,
     1717 Arch Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania,
18
     commencing at 9:40 a.m., before Janice L.
19
20
     Welsh, Court Reporter and Notary Public; in
21
     and for the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania,
     Friday, September 27, 2019.
22
23
     JOB No. 3563165
24
     PAGES 1 - 59
25
                                                     Page 1
```

1	APPEARANCES:	1	
2		2	ELIZABETH PANZARELLA, after
3	1 0	3	having been first duly sworn, was
4		4	examined and testified as follows:
5	LAW OFFICES OF ROBERT P. COCCO	5	THE DEPONDED II I
6		6	THE REPORTER: Usual
7			stipulations?  MR. COCCO: I don't think we need
8	Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19102	8	
9 10	Phone: (215) 351-0200	10	to read and sign. We're fine with that.
11	rcocco@rcn.com	11	(It is hereby stipulated and
12			agreed by and between counsel for respective
13			parties that reading, signing, sealing,
14	1 &		certification and filing are waived and that
15			all objections, except as to the form of
16			questions, be reserved until the time of
17	1840 Century Park East		trial.)
18	Suite 1900	18	
19		19	EXAMINATION
20	<b>C</b> /	20	
21	simonettil@gtlaw.com		BY MS. SIMONETTI:
22	<i>○6</i>	22	
23			moment ago briefly, but my name is Lisa
24			Simonetti, counsel for defendant. Can you
25			state your full name for the record, please?
	Page 2		Page 4
1	INDEX	1	A Elizabeth Marie Panzarella.
2		2	Q Have you ever gone by any other name?
3	Testimony of: Elizabeth Panzarella	3	A Liz.
4	By Ms. Simonetti 4	4	Q Do you have a maiden name?
5		5	A Yes. It was Smith.
6		6	Q Have you ever had your deposition taken
7		7	before?
8			A Years and years ago.
9	EXHIBITS		Q How many years ago?
10			A 25.
11			Q In what type of matter?
	NUMBER DESCRIPTION PAGE MARKED		A I worked for Shop Rite and there was
13	(None Marked)		I was the front end manager, and there was a
14			child eating candy, and they arrested the
15			mother, and I just had to be there to tell
16			what I saw.
17		17	1 6
18		18	
19		19	Č
20			the basic ground rules with you. The court
()1			reporter is taking down everything that you
21		22	cay verbatim   In voil inderstand that?
22			say verbatim. Do you understand that?
22 23		23	A Yes.
22 23 24		23 24	A Yes. Q In order to allow her to make a clean
22 23	Page 3	23 24	A Yes.

## Case 2:18-cv-03735-PBT Document 67-9 Filed 03/20/20 Page 4 of 7 ELIZABETH PANZARELLA

- 1 Q Has Matthew ever told you at any point
- 2 in time that he did list you as a reference on
- 3 his student loan?
- 4 A Unfortunately, no. Matthew has a habit
- 5 of not telling me things.
- 6 Q Has Matthew listed you as a reference on
- 7 any other credit obligation?
- 8 A Not that I'm aware of.
- 9 Q But he could have?
- 10 A He may have.
- 11 Q You told me earlier what your basic
- 12 understanding of a class action is. Do you
- 13 remember that?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q What is your understanding of the claims
- 16 that you're asserting for other people?
- 17 A That we're being called by a company
- 18 that we really have nothing to do with the
- 19 amount or the issue.
- 20 Q Is there anything else about the phone
- 21 calls that you would complain about?
- 22 A Yes. Just that they're very annoying,
- 23 distracting, and embarrassing if you turn your
- 24 phone on and people are there and you're
- 25 listening to your messages.

1 Q What is a skip trace process?

- 2 A I have no idea.
- 3 Q Have you ever heard of a system that's
- 4 called a mobile dialing system?
- 5 A No.
- 6 Q Did you pay any more for your cell phone
- 7 service than you would have otherwise, based
- 8 on the telephone calls from Navient?
- 9 A I guess I could answer that in two ways,
- 10 but no.
- 11 Q What is the other way to answer it?
- 12 A I'm just saying there was a period of
- 13 time when I had Matthew on my bill, and they
- 14 were calling him too, I guess. His phone bill
- 15 was always -- that's why I cut his phone off.
- 16 Q For what period of time was he on your
- 17 plan?
- 18 A Since he was 15 up until I want to say
- 19 two or three years ago.
- 20 Q Until he was around 29 to 30?
- 21 A It may be. He was furious with me
- 22 because I kept saying he had to pay his
- 23 portion, and he was ignoring me. So, I told
- 24 him I was going to shut his phone off if he
- 25 didn't start paying for it because his bill

Page 44

- Page 42

  Do you know anything about the manner in
- 2 which Navient Solutions made the telephone
- 3 calls through its systems?
- 4 A No. I don't.
- 5 Q Have you ever heard of the term auto
- 6 dial?
- 7 A No.
- 8 Q How about automatic telephone dialing
- 9 system?
- 10 A I'm not sure. Is that when a company
- 11 keeps repeatedly calling?
- 12 Q I'm asking you.
- 13 A That's the only thing I believe it to
- 14 be.
- 15 Q So, you don't have any understanding
- 16 beyond that?
- 17 A No. I just believe it to be a system
- 18 that automatically keeps calling you until
- 19 it's resolved.
- 20 Q So, in the complaint if you allege that
- 21 Navient initiated auto dial calls to you
- 22 multiple times on your cell phone, as stated
- 23 in paragraph 23, you mean that calls were made
- 24 repeatedly to you?
- 25 A Yes.

- 1 was -- he used a lot of cellular data. So,
- 2 there were months his bill alone would be over
- 3 \$100.00, and he wasn't paying it, and I was
- 4 responsible.
- 5 Q Did he have the same cell number through
- 6 this time period?
- 7 A Yes. He doesn't now.
- 8 O What was it?
- 9 A 484 -- it's been a while.
- 10 O Let me see if I can find it. Was it
- 11 484-638-0910?
- 12 A That may be it. I know my other two
- 13 boys' numbers start with 850, and I know my
- 14 son David's number is 850-2136, and he has
- 15 received calls too from Navient.
- 16 Q Do you recognize the cell number
- 17 610-505-0265?
- 18 A That was Matt.
- 19 Q Do you recognize this 484-638-0910
- 20 number at all?
- 21 A No. That may be one of his new numbers,
- 22 but I'm not sure.
- 23 Q So, you mentioned that at least one of
- 24 your other sons was receiving calls related to
- 25 Matthew's loans?

Page 45

Page 43

## Case 2:18-cv-03735-PBT Document 67-9 Filed 03/20/20 Page 5 of 7 ELIZABETH PANZARELLA

- 1 A No.
- 2 Q You have never heard of that?
- 3 A No
- 4 Q What is your understanding of your
- 5 responsibility in this case as a proposed
- 6 class representative?
- 7 A Just to state the facts for how annoying
- 8 these phone calls are, and they should not be
- 9 made to people that are not involved -- have
- 10 anything to do with money being owed.
- 11 Q Do you know whether Navient Solutions
- 12 might have any obligation on federal loans to
- 13 attempt to locate borrowers that are
- 14 delinquent?
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q Do you have any understanding of --
- 17 strike that.
- So, aside from representing
- 19 other people who think the calls are annoying,
- 20 is there anything else that you think you have
- 21 a duty to undertake with respect to other
- 22 people?
- 23 A Yes. Just that it's an invasion of
- 24 privacy for one thing, and it's inconvenient,
- 25 it's annoying, it's stressful when your phone
  - Page 50

- 1 your cell phone and keep harassing you.
- 2 That's about it.
- 3 Q Have you ever heard of the Fair Debt
- 4 Collection Practices Act?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Again, aside from anything Mr. Cocco has
- 7 told you, what is your understanding of what
- 8 that provides?
- 9 A Just what Mr. Cocco told me.
- 10 Q So, you haven't done any research into
- 11 the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act?
- 12 A No.
- 13 Q And not the TCPA either?
- 14 A No. I can't say I'm really -- aside
- 15 from playing my games --
- 16 Q You're not a researcher?
- 17 A No. I'm too busy with my
- 18 grandchildren.
- 19 Q So, can you explain to me why you
- 20 believe you're a suitable class representative
- 21 in the case?
- 22 A Well, I like the law -- I mean, like I
- 23 said, I would like it to stop, harassing

1 collect. I just would like it to stop.

- 24 people that don't really have anything to do
- 25 with the loan or debt that they're trying to

Page 52

- 1 keeps ringing and you're somewhere that you
- 2 have to shut your phone off. I just don't
- 3 think it's right.
- 4 Q Do you understand that there are two
- 5 claims asserted in the amended complaint?
- 6 A The phone calls?
- 7 Q No. What is your understanding of what
- 8 the complaint is seeking against Navient
- 9 Solutions?
- 10 A I guess just a solution to them to stop
- 11 calling.
- 12 Q Anything else?
- 13 A Whatever the Court feels.
- 14 Q Do you have any understanding of what
- 15 the claims are in the amended complaint?
- 16 A About them calling people without their
- 17 permission that have nothing to do with the
- 18 loan.
- 19 Q Have you ever heard of the Telephone
- 20 Consumer Protection Act?
- 21 A Yes. I have.
- 22 Q Aside from anything your lawyer has told
- 23 you about that, and we can call it TCPA, what
- 24 is your understanding of what it provides?
- 25 A That collectors are not allowed to call

- 3 who is receiving calls from --4 A No. I haven't.
- 5 MR. COCCO: You have to let her

Have you spoken with any other person

- 6 finish.
- 7 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry.
- 8 MR. COCCO: That's all right.
- 9 BY MS. SIMONETTI:
- 10 Q Have you spoken with anyone else who has
- 11 received calls from Navient, aside from the
- 12 family members that you have identified?
- 13 A No. I haven't.
- 14 Q So, as you sit here today, do you know
- 15 whether any other person is annoyed by
- 16 receiving these types of telephone calls?
- 17 A No. I don't.
- 18 Q Is there any reason that your other
- 19 family members have not joined you and your
- 20 son as plaintiffs in this case?
- 21 A I didn't ask them.
- 22 Q Were they annoyed by the telephone
- 23 calls?
- 24 A Yes. They were.
- 25 Q But you did not ask them to join in the

Page 53

Page 51

1		
1	CERTIFICATE	
2		
3	I, Janice L. Welsh, a Notary	
	Public, do hereby certify that the foregoing	
	deposition of Elizabeth Panzarella, was taken	
	before me, pursuant to notice, at the time and place indicated; that said deponent was by me	
	duly sworn to tell the truth, the whole truth,	
	and nothing but the truth; that the testimony	
	of said deponent was correctly recorded in	
	machine shorthand by me and thereafter	
12	transcribed under my supervision and	
13	computer-aided transcription; that the	
	deposition is true and that I am neither of	
	counsel nor kin to any party in said action,	
1	nor interested in the outcome thereof.	
17	Witness my hand and official	
19	seal this 15th day of October, 2019.	
20		
21		
22	Deren Contract	
23	JANICE L. WELSH	
24	Notary Public	
25	D 40	
	Page 58	
1	ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF DEPONENT	
2	I,, do hereby	
2 3	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages	
2 3 4	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct	
2 3 4 5	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to	
2 3 4 5 6	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for	
2 3 4 5 6 7	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for the corrections or changes in form or	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for the corrections or changes in form or substance, if any, noted in the attached	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for the corrections or changes in form or substance, if any, noted in the attached Errata Sheet.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for the corrections or changes in form or substance, if any, noted in the attached	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for the corrections or changes in form or substance, if any, noted in the attached Errata Sheet.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for the corrections or changes in form or substance, if any, noted in the attached Errata Sheet.  DATE SIGNATURE	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for the corrections or changes in form or substance, if any, noted in the attached Errata Sheet.  DATE SIGNATURE  Subscribed and sworn to before me this	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for the corrections or changes in form or substance, if any, noted in the attached Errata Sheet.  DATE SIGNATURE	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages to and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions herein propounded, except for the corrections or changes in form or substance, if any, noted in the attached Errata Sheet.  DATE SIGNATURE  Subscribed and sworn to before me this	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	I,	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	I,	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	I,	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	I,	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	I,	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	I,	

## VERITEXT LEGAL SOLUTIONS COMPANY CERTIFICATE AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Veritext Legal Solutions represents that the foregoing transcript is a true, correct and complete transcript of the colloquies, questions and answers as submitted by the court reporter. Veritext Legal Solutions further represents that the attached exhibits, if any, are true, correct and complete documents as submitted by the court reporter and/or attorneys in relation to this deposition and that the documents were processed in accordance with our litigation support and production standards.

Veritext Legal Solutions is committed to maintaining the confidentiality of client and witness information, in accordance with the regulations promulgated under the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA), as amended with respect to protected health information and the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act, as amended, with respect to Personally Identifiable Information (PII). Physical transcripts and exhibits are managed under strict facility and personnel access controls. Electronic files of documents are stored in encrypted form and are transmitted in an encrypted fashion to authenticated parties who are permitted to access the material. Our data is hosted in a Tier 4 SSAE 16 certified facility.

Veritext Legal Solutions complies with all federal and State regulations with respect to the provision of court reporting services, and maintains its neutrality and independence regardless of relationship or the financial outcome of any litigation. Veritext requires adherence to the foregoing professional and ethical standards from all of its subcontractors in their independent contractor agreements.

Inquiries about Veritext Legal Solutions' confidentiality and security policies and practices should be directed to Veritext's Client Services Associates indicated on the cover of this document or at www.veritext.com.